915 L STREET SACRAMENTO CA 95814-3706 WWW.DOF.CA.GOV

April 17, 2009

Mr. David E. Wilson, Chief Executive Officer Conservation & Liquidation Office 425 Market Street, 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94105

Dear Mr. Wilson:

### Final Report—Executive Life Insurance Company Estate Financial Statement Review, December 2008

The Department of Finance, Office of State Audits and Evaluations, has completed its review of the Executive Life Insurance Company Estate assigned to the Conservation & Liquidation Office (CLO) for the period January 1, 2008 through December 31, 2008.

The enclosed report is for your information and use. We appreciate the assistance and cooperation of the CLO staff and management. If you have any questions regarding this report, please contact Kimberly Tarvin, Manager, or Rick Cervantes, Supervisor, at (916) 322-2985.

Sincerely.

David Botelho, Chief

Office of State Audits and Evaluations

#### Enclosure

cc: Mr. Ray Minehan, Chief Financial Officer, Conservation & Liquidation Office

Mr. Ed Hahn, Vice President Estate Finance Group, Conservation & Liquidation Office

Mr. Keith Nelson, Chief, Ethics and Operational Compliance Office, California Department of Insurance

Mr. Jim Richardson, Chair, Audit Committee, California Department of Insurance

# FINANCIAL STATEMENT REVIEW

Executive Life Insurance Company Estate
Conservation & Liquidation Office
For the Period January 1, 2008
through December 31, 2008

Prepared By:
Office of State Audits and Evaluations
Department of Finance

090845116 DGR March 2009

#### **MEMBERS OF THE TEAM**

Kimberly Tarvin, CPA Manager

Rick Cervantes, CPA Supervisor

Staff
Amanda Bihlman
Arloa Singhsnaeh
Timothy Yee
Bryan Nguyen

You can contact our office at:

Department of Finance
Office of State Audits and Evaluations
300 Capitol Mall, Suite 801
Sacramento, CA 95814
(916) 322-2985

# Table of Contents

Executive Summary	į
Independent Accountant's Report	-
Statement of Assets and Liabilities	2
Statement of Operations	3
Statement of Cash Flows	2
Notes to the Statements	Ę

## Executive Summary

The California Department of Insurance (Department) takes a leading role to conserve, rehabilitate, or liquidate licensed California financially distressed and insolvent insurance enterprises under appointment by the Superior Courts. The Department's involvement helps secure consumer interests and provide for a stable, consistent insurance market.

The Conservation & Liquidation Office (CLO), created in 1994 to be the successor of the Conservation & Liquidation Division of the Department, is appointed by the California Insurance Commissioner (Commissioner) to oversee the affairs of financially impaired insurance enterprises domiciled in California. Financially impaired insurance enterprises are usually subject to a period of court supervised conservation under CLO administration. During this time, the CLO, along with the regulators, explore opportunities for rehabilitation. Financially distressed life insurance enterprises are frequently conserved, with policyholder liabilities and related invested assets transferred to a third party acquirer. However, for the vast majority of financially distressed property and casualty insurance enterprises, the enterprises will not be conserved, but liquidated.

For enterprises liquidated, the Commissioner, acting through the CLO, assumes title of the enterprise's assets. The insurance enterprise offices are closed, all outstanding policies are cancelled, and the process of obtaining and liquidating the enterprise's remaining assets begins. The books and records of the enterprise are acquired by the CLO for use during this process. The goal of liquidation is to apply the money acquired from liquidating the enterprise's assets toward the enterprise's debts and outstanding insurance claims. Upon issuance of a liquidation order, the CLO issues a notice to all interested parties, including the enterprise's policyholders, creditors, and shareholders. The notice requests proofs of claim be filed with the CLO in order to participate in a distribution of assets. An enterprise subject to a conservation or liquidation order is referred to as an estate. The costs of the CLO administration are borne by the estate of the insolvent entity. For estates with no assets, the California Insurance Fund supplements the costs. The process of conservation and subsequent liquidation can take several years.

The Commissioner, under California Insurance Code Section 1060, is required to transmit an annual report of information on the estates under his supervision to the Governor. These estates include those for which the Commissioner is fully responsible; those for which the Commissioner has custodial responsibilities; and those for which the Commissioner is fully responsible, but are operated separately. As of December 31, 2008, 26 open estates and 3 trusts of liquidated insurers are subject to the oversight of the CLO. In 2008, the CLO made interim and final distributions totaling \$380 million and closed one estate.

The California Insurance Code Sections 1060 and 1061 authorize and require the Department of Finance to conduct biennial examinations of the Commissioner's books and accounts in support of the annual report transmitted to the Governor.

Specifically, the objectives of the engagement were to perform a review of the open estates' Statement of Assets and Liabilities, Statement of Operations, and Statement of Cash Flows (Statements) as of December 31, 2008, in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. An individual report for each estate reviewed, including any applicable restrictions on its use, will be issued.

Our review included those estates assigned to the CLO's Special Deputy Insurance Commissioner and considered open by the Superior Court; and did not include estates assigned to other Special Deputy Insurance Commissioners. Financial reports for estates assigned to other Special Deputy Insurance Commissioners are issued under separate cover by separate entities.

#### **Review Results**

Based on our review, nothing came to our attention that caused us to believe that the Statements for the year ended December 31, 2008 are not presented, in all material respects, in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles Liquidation Basis of Accounting.

This report is intended for the information and use of the California Department of Insurance, the CLO, and the courts, and should not be used for any other purpose. However, the report is a matter of public record and its distribution is not limited.



# INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT'S REPORT

Mr. David E. Wilson, Chief Executive Officer Conservation & Liquidation Office 425 Market Street, 23<sup>rd</sup> Floor San Francisco, CA 94105

We have reviewed the Statement of Assets and Liabilities, Statement of Operations, and Statement of Cash Flows (Statements) for the Executive Life Insurance Company Estate for the year ended December 31, 2008. The Conservation & Liquidation Office (CLO), as assigned conservator/liquidator, is responsible for the Statements.

Our review was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. A review is substantially less in scope than an examination, the objective of which is the expression of an opinion on the Statements. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion.

Based on our review, nothing came to our attention that caused us to believe that the Statements of the Executive Life Insurance Company Estate for the year ended December 31, 2008 are not presented, in all material respects, in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Principles Liquidation Basis of Accounting.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the California Department of Insurance, the CLO, and the courts, and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties. However, this report is a matter of public record and its distribution is not limited.

David Botelho, CPA

Chief, Office of State Audits and Evaluations

(916) 322-2985

March 23, 2009

# Statement of Assets and Liabilities

#### Executive Life Insurance Company Estate Statement of Assets and Liabilities As of December 31, 2008

Assets Participation in Pooled Investments, at Market	\$	Balance 42,824,441
Non-Pooled Short-Term Investments, at Market: Restricted		15,748,190
Accrued Investment Income		300,787
Other Receivable	_	1,653,411
Total Assets	\$	60,526,829
Liabilities		
Secured Claims	\$	6,653,612
Accrued Administrative Expenses		1,513,439
Policyholder Claims		2,998,670,665
Distributions		(737,275,943)
All Other Claims		428,836
Total Liabilities		2,269,990,609
Net Assets (Deficiency)	<u>\$</u>	<u>(2,209,463,780</u> )

The notes are an integral part of the financial statements.

# Statement of Operations

#### Executive Life Insurance Company Estate Statement of Operations For the Year Ended December 31, 2008

Expenses	Balance
Legal Expenses	\$ 1,580,875
Consultants and Temps	585,336
Office Expenses	119,994
Allocated Overhead Expenses	(212,976)
Total Expenses	2,073,229
Investments	
Investment Income	2,527,733
Investment Expenses	(56,176)
Gain (Loss) on Securities	1,286,848
Net Investment Income	3,758,405
Net Income (Loss)	<b>\$ 1,685,176</b>

The notes are an integral part of the financial statements.

# $S_{\text{TATEMENT OF }}C_{\text{ASH }}F_{\text{LOWS}}$

#### Executive Life Insurance Company Estate Statement of Cash Flows For the Year Ended December 31, 2008

Cash Flows from Operating Activities	
Net Income (Loss)	\$ 1,685,176
Increase (Decrease) in Secured Claim Liabilities	(10,993)
Increase (Decrease) in Accrued Administrative Expenses	290,460
Adjustments to Net Assets	(1,612,648)
Net Cash Flows from Operating Activities	351,995
Cash Flows from Investing Activities Decrease (Increase) in Accrued Investment Income	(60,835)
Cash Flows from Financing Activities	0
Net Increase (Decrease) in Cash	291,160
Cash at Beginning of Period	58,281,471
Cash at End of Period	<u>\$ 58,572,631</u>

The notes are an integral part of the financial statements.

#### 1. Organization

The California Insurance Commissioner (Commissioner), an elected official of the State of California, acts under the supervision of the Superior Court (Court) when conserving and liquidating insurance enterprises. In this capacity, the Commissioner is responsible for taking possession (conservation) of the assets of financially troubled insurance enterprises domiciled or incorporated in California. An enterprise subject to a conservation or liquidation order is referred to as an estate.

The Commissioner applies to the Court for a conservation order to place a financially troubled enterprise in conservatorship. Under a conservation order, the Commissioner takes possession of the insolvent estate's financial records and real and personal property, and conducts the business of the estate until a final disposition regarding the estate is determined. The conservation order allows the Commissioner to begin an investigation that will determine, based on the estate's financial condition, if the estate can be rehabilitated, or if continuing business would be hazardous to its policyholders, creditors, or the public.

If, at the time the conservation order is issued or anytime thereafter, it appears to the Commissioner that it would be futile to proceed with the conservation of the financially troubled estate, the Commissioner will apply for an order to liquidate the estate's business. In response to this application, the Court may order the Commissioner to liquidate the estate's business in the most expeditious fashion.

In order to discharge his or her responsibility as conservator or liquidator, the Commissioner appoints special deputy insurance commissioners as agents to act on his behalf. The Commissioner has formed the Conservation & Liquidation Office (CLO) to support the activities of one of these special deputy insurance commissioners. The CLO was created in 1994 to be the successor to the Conservation & Liquidation Division of the Department of Insurance, which was managed by State employees. The CLO is based in San Francisco, California.

The Commissioner ordered the conservation of Executive Life Insurance Company (ELIC) on April 11, 1991, partly due to a decline in value of its multi-billion dollar investment portfolio of high yield corporate bonds, commonly known as "junk bonds." At the time, it was the largest life insurance insolvency in United States history. ELIC had more than 350,000 policyholders when the liquidation order was signed on December 6, 1991.

On March 3, 1992, pursuant to Court approval, the Commissioner consummated the sale of ELIC's junk bond portfolio. A comprehensive rehabilitation plan was adopted and became effective on September 3, 1993. As a part of the plan, the policyholders either elected to accept new coverage (opt in) from Aurora National Life Assurance Company (Aurora) or elected to opt out and terminated their policies for cash. Over the years, Enhancement Trusts were

established as a part of the liquidation process to distribute assets to the ELIC Opt Out Trust for subsequent disbursement to the policyholders that opted out, or to Aurora to distribute cash or dividends and/or to enhance the policy values of the policyholders that opted in.

#### 2. Basis of Presentation

During 2008, the CLO managed three trusts in addition to the ELIC Estate: ELIC Holdback Trust, ELIC Opt-Out Trust, and ELIC FEC Litigation Trust. This report presents the results for the ELIC Estate (Estate) only.

The accompanying financial statements have been prepared on the liquidation basis of accounting in conformity with generally accepted accounting principles. These financial statements reflect the financial position and activity of the Estate, which has been assigned to the CLO by the Commissioner in his role as liquidator.

Under the liquidation basis of accounting, assets are stated at their estimated net realizable values. Liabilities are stated at their ultimate amounts and are subsequently adjusted to settlement amounts upon final distribution. A new cost basis is established as of the date of liquidation.

#### 3. Summary of Significant Accounting Policies

#### **Priority of Claims**

California Insurance Code Section 1033 prescribes that claims on estate assets are paid according to a priority, except when otherwise provided in a rehabilitation plan. The probability of a valid claim being paid is dependent on the valuation of the claim, the order of preference of the claim, and the amount of funds remaining after other claims having higher preference have been discharged. Each priority class of claims must be fully paid before any distribution may be made to the next priority class. All members of a class receiving partial payment must receive the same pro-rata amount.

#### **Estimate of Future Administrative Costs**

Generally accepted accounting principles require that the financial statements of entities in liquidation provide for an estimate of future administrative costs. It is the CLO's policy not to accrue estimates of future administrative costs except when the Court has approved a final distribution order and the estate is scheduled to be closed within the following twelve months.

#### ASSETS:

#### Cash and Cash Equivalents

Cash and Cash Equivalents consist of cash in banks, investments in money market funds, and all investments with original maturities of three months or less. Investments with maturities of greater than three months, but due in one year or less, are classified as short-term investments.

Restricted cash is segregated in accordance with restrictions imposed by court order, a loan or security agreement, California statute, or escrow agreements, and is generally unavailable for administrative expenses. The Estate held no restricted cash as of December 31, 2008.

#### **Pooled Investments**

All investments, including short-term investments and debt and equity securities, are stated at fair value, which approximates market value. Market values are those provided by the

depository trust institution in possession of the securities at the balance sheet date or through brokerage institutions. Where market values are not readily determinable, book values are used.

The majority of the invested assets of the estates are combined for investment purposes into an investment pool, divided equally between two investment management firms. Each of the participating estates owns a percentage of the pool based on its proportionate share of the fair value of the pool's net assets. The net assets are valued at fair value on a monthly basis and estate ownership is computed monthly based on contributions and withdrawals by participating estates. Realized and unrealized gains and losses are allocated monthly based on the estate's ownership percentage in the pool at month end.

Pooled investments may be considered restricted. However, the Estate held no restricted pooled short-term investments as of December 31, 2008.

#### Non-Pooled Short-Term Investments

Non-pooled Short-Term Investments consist of investments with maturities greater than three months but less than one year and are funds that cannot be commingled with other funds. Non-pooled investments are held by a custodian bank, and for larger non-pooled investment accounts, an investment manager oversees the investment.

Non-pooled investments are stated at fair value, which approximates market value. Market values are those provided by the depository trust institution in possession of the securities at the balance sheet date or through brokerage institutions. Where market values are not readily determinable, book values are used.

Restricted investments are either restricted by court order, held in trust, or represent a deposit whose use is restricted by statute. The Estate held \$15,748,190 in restricted non-pooled short-term investments as of December 31, 2008.

#### **Accrued Investment Income**

Accrued Investment Income represents monthly estimates of interest and dividends earned on cash and investments held by the Estate. For pooled investments, interest accruals are allocated based on the Estate's percentage of ownership in the pool. Non-pooled interest accruals are on an estate by estate basis. Each month interest and dividends are accrued and posted to the Estate's account. Upon receipt of the earnings, the accruals are reversed and actual amounts received are posted.

#### Other Receivables

Other Receivables consist of an account held by Aurora reserved for covering the additional costs to policyholder adjustments for Opt In contracts as may be required. Any remaining amount will be returned to the Estate for distribution to all Opt In policyholders.

#### LIABILITIES:

#### Secured Claims

Secured Claims represents funds allocated to Opt In policyholders involved in the Pennsylvania Class Action suit, where the Pennsylvania Life and Health Insurance Guaranty Association (PLHIGA) has certain subrogation rights; and unclaimed funds payable, which are funds distributed to claimants that were returned as undeliverable and/or an accurate address could

not be located. Unclaimed funds are eventually escheated to the California State Controller's Office.

#### **Accrued Administrative Expenses**

Accrued Administrative Expenses represent administrative expenses which have been accrued but not yet paid.

Generally accepted accounting principles require that the financial statements of entities in liquidation provide for an estimate of future administrative costs. Because the final resolution of litigation, reinsurance, and other matters which impact the closure of the estate may take more than ten years to resolve, it is the CLO's policy not to accrue estimates of future administrative costs, except when the Court has approved a final distribution order and the estate is scheduled to be closed within the following twelve months.

#### **Policyholder Claims**

Policyholder Claims is the difference between policyholder liabilities at the time the Estate was conserved and the restructured liability based on Conservation Date Statutory Reserve (CDSR) as defined in the Estate Rehabilitation Plan, adjusted by the payment of pre-conservation death claims benefits.

#### Distributions

CLO assumed management of the Estate on August 1, 1997. Distributions include the transfer of funds from the Estate to the ELIC Opt Out Trust (for subsequent disbursement to the policyholders who opted out), or to Aurora National Life Assurance Company (for subsequent disbursement of cash or dividends to the policyholders that opted in).

In 2008, the Estate made no distributions.

#### All Other Claims

All Other Claims represent pre-liquidation accounts payable amounts due to general creditors. To the extent that assets remain in the estate after higher priority class claimants have been satisfied, the general creditors will receive a distribution. This is deemed unlikely.

#### **EXPENSES:**

#### Administrative Expenses

Administrative Expenses consists of both direct and indirect expenses.

Direct Expenses are directly charged to estates whenever individually attributable to the estate. These expenses consist of legal costs, consultants and contractors, salaries and benefits of employees working exclusively for a single estate, office expenses, and depreciation and capitalization of property and equipment. Reversals or reimbursements of certain legal and litigation-related expenses incurred in prior years are booked to current year financial statements. In certain cases, such reversals or reimbursements may exceed current year expenses, and could result in net negative administrative expenses for the year for certain estates.

Administrative expenses not directly charged to an estate are allocated to each estate on a proportional basis. Allocated expenses applicable to all of the estates include CLO employee compensation and benefits, payroll taxes, indirect legal expenses, rent, utilities, and other general overhead costs. These shared expenses are allocated to each estate based on factors

derived from the direct CLO labor hours charged to each estate, and in some instances direct contractor hours charged.

During 2008, the CLO reviewed the methodology used in certain prior years to charge the allocated overhead expenses to estates managed by the CLO. This review resulted in additional charges to certain estates and offsetting credits to several estates. The Estate was credited \$965,507 plus interest.

#### INVESTMENTS:

#### Investment income

Investment Income is comprised of interest and dividends earned on cash and investments held by the estate. For estates with investments in the pool, income is allocated based on the estate's proportional share in the pool.

#### **Investment Expenses**

Investment Expenses is comprised of investment and interest expenses related to cash and investments held by the estate. For estates with investments in the pool, the expenses are allocated based on the estate's proportional share in the pool.

#### Gain (Loss) on Securities

Gain (Loss) on Securities consists of long and short term gains and losses incurred as part of the investment pool, mark to market adjustments, gains and losses on non-pooled reappraisals of securities, and gains and losses incurred on the transfer of non-pooled securities into the pool. The long and short term gains and losses and mark to market adjustments are allocated based on the estate's proportional share in the pool. Gains and losses on the reappraisal of non-pooled securities and the transfer of non-pooled securities into the pool are reported on an estate by estate basis.

Unrealized and realized gains and losses are included as a component of net investment income. The cost of securities sold is based on specific identification and realized gains (losses) are computed based on the securities' original cost. Transfers of non-pooled investments to a pool are a sale resulting in non-pooled realized gains and losses and a noncash transfer. Transfers from one pool to the other are a sale resulting in pooled realized gains and losses and a non-cash transfer.

#### 4. Litigation

The Estate is party to the legal proceeding Garamendi v. Altus et. al. The Commissioner, in his capacity as conservator, rehabilitator, and liquidator of the Estate, commenced a civil action in 1999 against various defendants, alleging that they had fraudulently and unlawfully obtained control over a California insurance company, ELIC's former bond portfolio, and insurance assets in violation of federal and state laws prohibiting a foreign government-owned bank from acquiring control of a California insurance company. The last standing defendant in this lawsuit is Artemis S.A.; a two-thirds owner of Aurora National Life Assurance Co., the company formed to receive the transfer of Estate assets and restructured policies under the Rehabilitation Plan. Altus Finance S.A. (Altus) is the entity that purchased and received the transferred bonds pursuant to the Rehabilitation Plan.

In August 2008, the United States Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals vacated the restitution award of \$241 million, confirmed the District Court's decision to vacate the jury's \$700 million award,

and remanded the case to the District Court for determination of damages. Trial is expected to begin in November 2009. To date, the Commissioner recovered approximately \$730 million.

The Estate is party to the legal proceeding ELIC Indenture Trustee Policyholders v. Insurance Commissioner, where the Indenture Trustee Policyholders objected to CLO's internal allocated and other legal administrative expenses incurred by the Estate from 1997 to 2008. The matter is being heard before the Conservation Court in Los Angeles.

#### 5. Subsequent Events

There are no reportable subsequent events for this Estate.